



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 7, 2015

Mr. Brandon S. Shelby
City of Attorney
City of Sherman
P.O. Box 1106
Sherman, Texas 75091-1106

OR2015-08935

Dear Mr. Shelby:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 562793 (Sherman Internal Ref. No. OR-1764 - SPD#021).

The Sherman Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to named individual.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from

¹We note the department sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Common-law privacy protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). The doctrine of common-law privacy also protects a compilation of an individual’s criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B)* (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual, thus implicating the named individual’s rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, the department has submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant or that

²We note that although the department does not raise section 552.136 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand it to raise this exception based on its markings. We also note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See Gov’t Code § 552.301(b)*. Nevertheless, because the exceptions the department claims can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider the department’s claimed exception for the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

pertains to a routine traffic offense. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate the individual's right to privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold this information as a compilation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, upon review, we find the information we have marked and indicated satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.³

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, and we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 states, "Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the bank account and routing numbers you have marked, and we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, and we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the bank account and routing numbers you have marked, and we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Rustam Abedinzadeh". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Rustam" and last name "Abedinzadeh" clearly distinguishable.

Rustam Abedinzadeh
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RA/dls

Ref: ID# 562793

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)